

CENTER FOR MIDDLE EASTERN STUDIES | LUND UNIVERSITY

# "The Dream Recently Came True": Globalization and Media Discourse about Kuwaiti Policewomen

Staci Strobl UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN-PLATTEVILLE STROBLST@UWPLATT.EDU

The existence of policewomen in Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) countries is often painted as evidence of the political and cultural liberalization of the Gulf. It is also seen as representing gender equality, and respect for human rights in the region – important for enticing global economic trade and investment in these countries, as well as maintaining positive relationships with strategic, Western allies. This article draws on a multi-dimensional theoretical framework including globalization, cultural criminological and comparative feminist theories, to unearth the social and political meanings of the introduction of women police in Kuwait in 2009. Like their counterparts in other Gulf countries, their new deployment spawned a media discourse about them as signifiers of political, social, and economic liberalization, modernization, and globalization, designed to influence global perceptions of Kuwait; however, other contested meanings were also palpable. The present research is a discourse analysis of English and Arabic newspaper articles from May 2008 to April 2012 primarily aimed at non-Kuwaiti media consumers. A close reading of these articles uncovers the stated reasons that women should be welcomed into the national police force: as service providers to the nation; pioneering women in a male-dominated field; defenders of traditional gender segregation; and symbols of modernization and development. Meanwhile internal ambiguity and contestation about women's roles in positions of authority are also confronted, such as their problematic deployment given more conservative notions of female identity in both the cultural and religious senses. Overall, the research shows that the media coverage about Kuwaiti policewomen puts forth a bipolar frame of the debate about their deployment as being one about tradition versus modernization. This framing obscures the nuance in the debate and the notion that policewomen in Kuwait may actually be symbols of both tradition and modernity simultaneously.

Keywords:

media; discourse analysis; police; globalization; tradition; Kuwait

#### INTRODUCTION

In 2009, Kuwait graduated its first batch of policewomen from its national police academy, leaving Saudi Arabia as the only Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) without women police. The earliest indigenous female police units in the Arab Gulf region operated in Bahrain and Oman in the early 1970s. In GCC nations' police forces, policewomen primarily find themselves in segregated units, working on cases involving women and juveniles as victims, witnesses and offenders. They also work as security screeners in airports and provide support services to women and children victims and witnesses. Women make up roughly five percent of police forces in Oman, Qatar, and the United Arab Emirates (Strobl 2007) and more than ten percent of the force in Bahrain (Strobl 2008).

The presence of women in policing in the Gulf represents a modern shift in the exclusively male responsibility for community safety and security in the context of originally kin-based small-scale societies (Strobl 2010a; 2010b). Policewomen can be traced to European colonial agents and advisors in the early and mid-20th century who sought to install local women in policing as markers of their modernizing endeavors. Previous analysis of policewomen in Bahrain suggests that the inclusion of policewomen in that GCC country was a result of British efforts to instill a legacy of gaining greater public status for women, seizing on the approval of then-Emir Sheikh Isa bin Salman al-Khalifah to do so. As such, it is hard to separate women in policing in the region from the colonial experience of external subjugation (Strobl 2008).

The advent of women in policing, though a Western transplant, appealed to those in Gulf societies who valued more traditional notions of women's honor and wanted women victims, witnesses, and offenders managed by other women. Maintaining gender segregation in criminal justice arenas, transformed from local dispute resolution venues into modern, bureaucratic entities in the 20th century, posed a particular cultural problem for women participants who risked their honor and reputation by interacting with male actors in the public space of the criminal justice system. In this sense, it was precisely because of traditional gender segregation that policewomen were needed to handle cases involving women in a way that would maintain their honor and reputations (Strobl 2010b).

Despite a nuanced history, policewomen in the GCC are most often painted as markers of the political and cultural liberalization of Gulf states. They are cited in mainstream media both within and outside the region as evidence of gender equality and a respect for human rights. This is important for enticing global economic trade and investment in these countries, recruiting skilled expatriate labor,

as well as maintaining positive relationships with strategic, Western allies. This article draws on a multi-dimensional theoretical framework, including globalization, cultural criminological and comparative feminist theories, to unearth the social and political meanings of the introduction of women police in Kuwait. Like their counterparts in other Gulf countries, their new deployment spawned a media discourse about them as signifiers of political, social, and economic liberalization, modernization, and globalization, designed to influence global perceptions of Kuwait as a liberalizing country; however, other contested meanings were also palpable. The present discourse analysis of English and Arabic newspaper articles from May 2008 through April 2012 explores the stated reasons for allowing women to join the national police force, and confronts internal ambiguity and contestation about women's roles in positions of authority.

# GLOBALIZATION AND POLICEWOMEN AS MARKERS OF LIBERALIZATION

Because of the economic dominance of the West, globalization has enabled the spread of Western, liberal political ideas, as global capital gravitates to countries the West perceives as having developing civil and democratic institutions (Doumato and Posusney 2003). Even though the GCC countries are not full-fledged democracies, and may not be moving toward developing democracy in the Western sense, the presence of some democratic institutions and mechanisms such as parliaments and elections serve as markers of liberalization. Among Arab countries the Gulf societies "...are most responsive to globalization and open to its culture and tools..." because of the high level of infrastructural development, consumerism, and political connection with the West as a result of the exploitation of oil (The Emirates Center for Strategic Studies and Research 2009, 12).

The need to sell the country to global capitalists via democratization or liberalization becomes even more apparent when considering such watchdog mechanisms as the World Economic Forum's (WEF) annual Executive Option Survey, reported in The Global Competitiveness Report 2011-2012 (World Economic Forum 2012). The Kuwait National Bank, for example, takes WEF reports so seriously that they boast about good ratings on their website and provide web-links to the full reports. The Executive Opinion Survey asks more than 4,000 business executives and analysts about the countries in which they operate, providing a ranking of each country's level of friendliness to business. Among the questions in the section on "Government and public institutions" are measures of perceived police effectives, such as whether private businesses can rely on the police for protection (Sung 2006). Kuwait in particular tends

to score lower than Qatar, Saudi Arabia and the United Arab Emirates (UAE). In *The Global Competitiveness Report 2011-2012* Kuwait ranked as 37 among countries in which global executives operate. Only Bahrain among GCC countries ranked lower. In particular, the report on Kuwait's data indicated that inefficient government bureaucracy was the top problem in the country for business (while "crime and theft" ranked quite low among problems).

With continued British and American protection post-independence, against incursions by Iraq and other regional powers, Kuwait engages in continued alignment with the West. In particular, Kuwait signed a security agreement with the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) in December of 2006 (Centre for Research on Globalization 2006). Appearing to liberalize and democratize the police can act as positive publicity for the Kuwaiti police in the eyes of Western powers, from which the Kuwaiti nation needs support for its security and continued economic development. The Committee of Women in NATO Forces (CWINF) has articulated the NATO commitment to building and developing the full human potential of member countries by promoting the inclusion of women in all sectors of national security, citing them as particularly necessary in building sustainable solutions to conflict (Committee on Women in NATO Forces 2009). At the same time, Western powers are predisposed to value Kuwait for their own strategic purposes - such as countering the Iranian threat in the Gulf.

Police forces are among the institutions that serve as markers of a country's place along a "continuum of democracy," the level at which accountability, transparency, and compliance with human rights is found in the context of the rule of law (Haberfeld and Gideon 2008, 4-5). At the same time, police organizations are anomalies in developing democracies as their authority to legitimately use coercive and lethal force, often put them in direct odds with other principles of democracy such as individual freedoms and civil and human rights (Goldstein 1977). Regardless, policewomen in particular are representative of democratic forces; they are part of a larger incursion of women in public life in Kuwait.

Some globalization theorists emphasize that opportunities for increasing women's roles in the workplace and public life increases as countries work to attract Western investment through trade liberalization and competition (Moghadem 2003). This was empirically demonstrated in a recent cross-national study which reported a positive correlation between the level of liberal policies, such as gender equality, and the levels of attracted foreign direct investment (Martibez and Allard 2008-2009). Indeed, overall in the GCC we see that women's penetration into the workplace has been increasing during the age of globalization (Doumato and Posusney 2003). At the same time, the changing roles of women in society

has become a site of local contestation, encouraging forms of resistance to global capitalist development and its perceived threat to indigenous cultural identity and autonomy.

#### **BLAZING A TRAIL**

Because the global perception game focuses on marketing the penetrations of women into the workplace and public life, Kuwait is often touted as politically liberal in the press. Official and semi-official newspapers often feature what women are accomplishing outside the home. For example, Cherie Blair, wife of former British Prime Minister Tony Blair, visited Kuwait in 2007 and was reported as stating that the country is "blazing a trail in this region... while of course women gaining political rights is just the beginning" (Arab Times 2007a).

When women can be shown to be involved in traditionally male occupations - occupations that even in the West are male-dominated – a country can potentially achieve even greater impact in the global perception game. For example, in Bahrain, Bahraini policewomen are often deliberately posted at the airport, visible to passengers arriving from Western destinations. One police informant indicated that the deployment was a means by which the government attempts to show off women in a male-dominated profession and signal liberalization of the country. Further, a high ranking member of Bahrain's police explained that the introduction of policewomen to the General Directorate of Trafficking in 1991 did not emerge from a local mandate. Rather, he said, it was implemented "from the top" because the Al-Khalifah royal family became committed to modernizing the police through more liberal gender policies aimed to win over foreign critics (Strobl 2007). As one Bahraini policewoman said:

Today everyone wants policewomen in their units and stations because it reflects positively on the developments and changes in the country (Strobl 2007, 243).

Likewise, in 'Ajman, United Arab Emirates, mixed gender traffic patrols, initiated in 2003, were not the result of policewomen or the public requesting such assignments. Instead, it occurred as part of an overall Emirati strategy to bring women more into the forefront of public life to show the liberalizing trends in the country. The headline for the article on mixed patrols in the *Gulf News*, a publication aimed at expatriates in the region, says it all: "Improving image, crushing crime" (Al-Jandaly 2003). As such, policewomen are often deployed for reasons of "state feminism" in a globalized context (Stetson and Mazur 1995) — to institute policies that increase participation of women in public life in order to raise a country's public image.

# THE PUBLIC RELATIONS MESSAGE AND CONTESTATION

Anthropologists such as Michael Herzfeld (1997) concern themselves with the disemia, or tension, between official and vernacular attitudes. From this perspective "[t]he culture as lived is never quite the same as the culture as represented" (Katz and Csordas 2003, 285). The culture represented is partially shaped by officially promoted messages that find their way into mainstream media outlets, such as newspapers. Manipulating symbols for public consumption is the realm of public relations work and, like other cultural production, both reflects and creates social meaning. Cultural criminological theory posits that crime control is always subject to a process of meaning construction, particularly in today's media saturated times (Ferrell et. al. 2008). As Lila Abu-Lughod (2009) states, the political and social context of the production of knowledge and cultural artifacts should not be ignored in the Post-Saidian era in which the deconstruction of cultural concepts becomes crucial to legitimate scholarship. The presence of policewomen in the Gulf and how they are reported in mainstream media outlets contain important clues that must be unpacked to discern the deeper cultural and social meanings at play, both in official discourse, and that which may be operating underneath it.

# **EQUITY VS. EQUALITY**

Though the message to the western or foreign press is one of liberalizing female pioneers, the deployment of female officers has divergent internal meanings: they are not always viewed as symbols of positive development within Kuwait. In a study of Bahraini policewomen, the government and media celebrated their accomplishments while some local people were irked by them. Critics most often cited such reasons as the threat to honor (*sharaf*) of the women and her family in women embodying such a public role and the frailty of women in the presence of dangerous situations encountered in policing.<sup>1</sup>

#### **KUWAIT AND ITS NEW POLICEWOMEN**

Kuwait is a constitutional emirate with a population of 2.6 million people. The country is currently ruled by Emir Sabah al-Ahmad al-Jabir al-Sabah, and has a significant Shi'a minority (approximately 25 percent of the total population). Oil and petroleum production contribute half of its gross domestic product (GDP), 95 percent of export revenues, and 95 percent of government income. However, like many of its regional counterparts, Kuwait has attempted to diversify its industries by developing its financial services market as well as high-tech industries in recent years (The Emirates Center for Strategic Studies and Research 2009). Policing in the country is spread over its six governates: Al Ahmadi, Al 'Asimah, Al Farwaniyah, Al Jahra', Hawalli, and Mubarak al Kabir. The legal system is a hybrid form of British common law, civil code, and shari'a-inspired law (Central Intelligence Agency 2012).

#### A ROYAL PROMISE

Originally, a royal promise to allow women to join the police was revealed in 1994. Interior Minister Spokesperson Colonel Adel Al-Ibrahim explained at that time that the development and modernization of the country depended on it, as well as other measures, to ensure women's roles in security services (The Associated Press 1994). This promise was two years on the heels of the invitation for women to join the military, a by-product of the Iraqi invasion of Kuwait. Women contributed to the national resistance to the Iraqi occupation, and their desire to continue serving the defense of the country in an official way was much harder to ignore once the country was liberated, particularly since the Americans who aided liberation supported increasing women's roles in Kuwaiti public life. An official royal approval to create a women police unit in Kuwait, however, did not occur until 2001. Interior Minister Sheikh Mohammed Al-Khaled Al-Sabah explained to the royal cabinet that inaugurating policewomen was "a serious step" toward the augmentation of women's roles in public life "for the sake of noble national aims" (Kuwait News Agency (KUNA) 2001). The intention was then referred to the Emir's office for review and research; for unknown reasons, however, implementation was delayed eight more years (Asharq Al-Awsat 2008). As such, the promise to implement women in policing took 14 years to fulfill.

In 2009, Kuwait graduated its first 27 policewomen from its training academy: 16 lieutenants, eight deputy police officers and three sergeants (Al-Watan 2009). The new policewomen work as airport screeners, in the women's prison, and as trainers in the academy. A recruitment newspaper article indicated that the women were also intended to be deployed in passport issuing departments and special security de-

<sup>1</sup> An oft-heard Muslim critique involved the notion of gender equity, as opposed to equality celebrated in the West. This critique focused on the notion that women have different, but just as important and deserving of respect, roles as wives and mothers (Strobl 2008). Gender equity, rather than strict equality, is at the center of the Islamic feminism movement, an alternative to liberal feminism. Muslim scholar Jamal Badawi (1995) explains that gender role definition in the spirit of cooperation and "complimentarity" remains the preferred approach allowing for overall equity and justice, based on Quranic sources.

tails (Asharq Al-Awsat 2008). In 2010, an additional 48 policewomen were in training. Assuming all were sworn in, this brings the total policewomen in Kuwait to 75. To be eligible, recruits must be Kuwaiti citizens, be free of any criminal record, between 19 and 30 years in age, unmarried, and in good physical and mental health. They must be either graduates of secondary school, to start at a lower rank, or have a university degree, to be considered for officer-level ranks. The police academy educates them for six months on police and legal studies before field training begins in their sector assignments (Toumi 2010).

#### **METHODOLOGY**

The present research is a critical discourse analysis, and confronts mainstream media articles about the deployment of policewomen in Kuwait. Although there is no single reading of a text, discourse analysis centers on the most likely interpretations given the social and political context in which the text can be said to operate as a discursive strategy (Barthes 1972/1957), and evaluates what Fürsich (2009, 249) has called its "ideological potential."

This research analyzes 18 newspaper and news website articles which were found based on a Lexis-Nexis search of articles generated from keyword searches on "Kuwait" and "policewomen," and "Kuwait," "police," and "women," within the May 2008 to April 2012 time period, as well as a similar search on Google (in both English and Arabic).

The time period was selected because recruitment calls for policewomen began in Kuwait in the latter half of 2008 and articles on Kuwaiti policewomen can be followed for four years after that point. It should be noted that many articles published in the print media in Kuwait itself are not online or otherwise easily available. As such, several articles that did appear in print in Kuwait on the topic of policewomen could not be accessed. Therefore, a sample skewed toward articles available online and in world, regional or Arab diaspora publications, is appropriate in the context of this research. This is because the sample represents the discourse that is more easily accessible and enduring in the four years after the implementation of the female police. Articles which were extracted based on Lexis-Nexis and Google searches but did not speak directly to Kuwaiti policewomen's deployment were taken out of the sample. Newspapers such as Kuwait Times, Gulf News, Asharq Al-Awsat, and Arab Times are represented in the sample, as well as others. Articles from online sources such as Al-Arabiya, Al-Shorfa, Waahg, Al-Islam Al-Yom and Jouniha News Portal were also included. Because the focus of this article is on the discourse which would most likely reach people outside of Kuwait, there are more sources in English than Arabic. Appendix A details each of the articles analyzed. One weakness of the present analysis is that the sample is taken as a whole and does not differentiate between content generated by Kuwaitis and that which is not, nor does it compare discursive strategies based on the national identity

Table One: Emergent themes in the textual analysis

ke :nesses :r
nesses
r
mbat

of the owner of the publication or political ideology of the owner/newspaper.

The articles in the sample were examined for emergent themes which developed during the open-coding process. The 12 identified themes are displayed in Table One below.

Many of these themes overlapped in the articles and so they should not be taken as discrete categories. For example, in one article, an argument against women being trained in weapons handling was corollary to a larger discussion about the appropriateness or inappropriateness of policewomen given cultural and religious values within Kuwaiti society. Because of the fuzzy boundaries of the themes, it is not appropriate to attempt to count or quantify precise categories. Rather, this analysis is intended to sort through the meanings behind the deployment of policewomen in a more interpretive way. I did, however, lightly rank the themes into those that occurred more or less often, in order to attempt to sort through some meanings, or themes, appearing to receive more media coverage than others.<sup>2</sup>

# WHY ARE KUWAITI POLICEWOMEN WELCOME?

Reporting on the deployment of Kuwaiti policewomen reflected a media bias which seemed to favor them as a positive development. Among the top reasons that Kuwaiti policewomen are considered to be a positive development was that they demonstrate the growing opportunities for women to participate in service to the nation.

#### **NOBLE NATIONAL AIMS**

As Al-Watan reported in March of 2010, many praised the new policewomen for taking on the laudable task of serving their country. One respondent in Al-Watan's person-on-the-street interviews about policewomen welcomed them because they represented a chance for women to "favor genuine action over shopping trips." This comment apparently references a stereotype that many Kuwaiti women enjoy lives of leisure as consumers; being brought into police service represents a departure from the typical female pursuits in favor of something allegedly more useful to Kuwaiti society. The Arab Times reported in February 2012 that the government has been encouraging increased participation of women in all areas of society as a means of national participation and the Kuwaiti policewomen are prime examples. Al-Sharq Al-Awsat indicated the year before, that the

new policewomen reflect an opening up for women to participate in the protection of national security. Indeed, the original decision to deploy policewomen in the country was described by Interior Minister Sheikh Mohammed Al-Khaled Al-Sabah in the official news Kuwait News Agency (KUNA) as "...a serious step towards the practice of woman of [sic] her role for the sake of noble national aims" (Kuwait News Agency (KUNA), 2001).

#### WOMEN LIKE TO DEAL WITH OTHER WOMEN

Many of the articles reported that Kuwaiti policewomen are necessary in order to preserve traditional gender segregation in public spaces in Kuwait. A newly installed lieutenant in the force told Middle East Online:

Sometimes there are problems in female-only areas and the men can't enter; in our society women like to deal with other women.

Similarly, *Al-Shorfa* reported, having women in police stations "...spare the embarrassment of women and families wary of filing reports to male security officers." Kuwaiti policewomen interviewed for an *Arab Times* story cited the difficult situation policemen are put into when handling female misconduct. In subduing and arresting them, their physical contact with females could be called into question under traditional notions of the inappropriateness of touching a female not related to the man.

Further, women are also considered ideal police officers for issues around gender-related harassment and illegal displays of homosexuality, and as cited in some articles as perfect for enforcing Kuwaiti society's ethical codes. A July 2, 2010, *Gulf News* article revealed that the policewomen would be dispatched to malls and other places where the public gathers in order to fight "gender-queers, transsexuals and transvestites." It also explained that these patrolling policewomen will help to control gender-related harassment of men against women and vice versa.

#### **PLEASED TO BE PIONEERS**

Most of the articles implied, if not stated explicitly, that Kuwaiti policewomen were challenging gender norms in their society and as such can be considered heroic trailblazers. A *Middle East Online* article even editorialized that the policewomen were "pleased to be pioneers" as they took up their posts as ethical watchdogs in Kuwait's malls. According to

<sup>2</sup> For inter-rater reliability purposes, a research assistant read 8 of the 18 articles in order to provide a check on the analysis and agreed with the researcher about the themes present in all but one of the articles. In the article in which the researcher and research assistant differed, the disparity was resolved to mutual satisfaction.

<sup>3</sup> An article in *The Guardian* fleshed out the Kuwait phenomenon of *boyat*, the Arabization of the English word boy. This trend of young women dressing and behaving like men in public spaces, as well as vice versa, has caused alarm in Kuwait. Cross-dressing (transgendered expressions) and transsexuality are a criminal offense in the country (Moumneh 2011).

Al-Arabiya, "liberals" in Kuwaiti society welcomed the deployment of policewomen as a means of increasing the number of women in diverse sectors of society. Al-Watan reported that policewomen were taken by Kuwaiti bloggers as symbols of courage for breaking new ground for female participation in civil service. A Bahraini policewoman trainer of the Kuwaiti female force told the Arab Times that at the first call for female recruits, there was an incredibly enthusiastic response and that there were plenty of applicants. One of her Kuwaiti trainees added, "If you look at [Kuwaiti] society as a whole you will find a woman in almost every field and one of the leaders in that field as well."

# POLICEWOMEN PROVED THEIR SUCCESS AND THEIR METTLE

A common theme across many of the articles analyzed was the notion that women have the requisite talents and abilities to succeed in policing. Nawara Fattahova, reporter for the Kuwait Times, editorialized in 2010 that policewomen on patrol "sounded like a dream" a few years earlier, but "the dream recently came true." In the lead paragraph of her article, she highlights that the "masculine" job of policing was not as hard for women to do as many had originally thought. Similarly, Kuwaiti policewoman Lieutenant Loulwa Al-Salem told Jouniha News Portal that being "...trained on the same weapons the male police officers use" was a major accomplishment and source of pride. She said, "...we (females) were able to pull through the military training. It was a huge shift in my life." In an official Kuwaiti press release, Major General Yousef Al-Mudahakha, director of the Kuwaiti police academy, stated, "Policewomen proved their success and their mettle..." in completing their training program as the second batch of female officials. As a result, many security officials had requested even more female recruits. *El-Bayash*er, an Egyptian news website, reported that Kuwaiti security officials felt "appreciation and admiration" (taqdeer wa a'ajab) for the abilities of the new policewomen.

# **NEW HISTORICAL STAGE FOR KUWAITI SOCIETY**

In discussing the first group of Kuwaiti policewomen graduates from the police academy, *Al-Sharq Al-Awsat* characterized the event as representing a "... new historical stage for Kuwaiti society," in light of comments by the Interior Minister. During his graduation speech, the minister focused on the development of the country and its modernizing aims as one of the reasons to applaud the new policewomen. The idea that policewomen signify modernization or the country's progressive development sometimes was collapsed into the larger and more popular national service discourse cited as one of the top occurring

rationales identifiable in the sample. However, the two rationales were separable in the discourse as the nationalist one was often merely a matter of national identity, pride and/or national security while the other was sometimes present, on its own or along with the nationalist discourse, as specifically about modernization and development.

A corollary to the notion of policewomen as symbols of modern development was discourse in the media about the difficulty of social change (See "Change is tough" in Table One). Many Kuwaitis interviewed for articles about the new policewomen explained that because it was a new development, and people were not used to it as a social norm, it would naturally face opposition. Some believed this had nothing to do with gender, but a more general human resistance to change. As Kuwaiti policewomen Lieutenant Dalal Mohammed Mosa said:

When there was opposition in the beginning, it was only for the reason that this new development is new to Kuwait, not because it dealt with women. They were only pessimistic and thought the experiment would fail. However, when they saw the reality of the situation, the accepted and encouraged it (Appendix A, Article 17).

# **POLICEWOMEN GO HOME**

Some of the news article reported reasons why Kuwaiti policewomen should not be deployed in the country. There was particular anxiety over their deployment as patrol officers under the auspices of the Committee of Ethical Control in the summer of 2010. At that time, the policewomen were tasked with controlling everything from cross-dressing to gender-related harassment to inappropriate encounters between unrelated males and females. Overall, the criticism for deploying policewomen in Kuwait portrayed them as breaking up with traditional culture and an aspect of westernization.

#### A BREACH OF... TRADITION

A primary critique of policewomen expressed in the media involved the inappropriateness of women working in quasi-military organizations like the police. It was presented as a breach of tradition, whether religious or cultural, or as an unnatural occupation for females based on qualities believed to be innate to them.

According to the press, conservative politicians in Kuwait took the opportunity to use an incident of harassment in a local mall as an example of why policewomen should not be deployed in the country. The issue surfaced after some Kuwaiti policewomen themselves were verbally harassed by teenage youths while patrolling in a mall for ethical violations (such as cross-dressing). According to some media reports,

the policewomen responded by apprehending the youths and shaving their heads as punishment for their behavior. Because teenage boys reportedly take great pride in their gel-styled hair, this was framed as a humiliating punishment. However, other reports emphasized that the policewomen had to call on policemen for help in the situation, needing to be rescued from their teenage harassers. Conservative politicians attributed the harassment to the policewomen's immodest dress, citing uniforms of tight pants and tucked-in shirts. They further suggested that the policewomen are ironic upholders of public virtue as their own uniforms are not modest enough; they cited both traditional and Islamic standards in making this critique.

Conservative Member of Parliament Muhammed Hayef was reported in *Al-Islam Al-Yom* as directing a number of public criticisms toward the policewomen in Kuwait. Including the above worry about inappropriate uniforms, Hayef railed against the inappropriateness of having women police officers in general given Islamic values. He stated that the government is asking women to behave like men in having them perform the same tasks when, in fact, women's role in society is different from men. He stated to *Al-Arabiya* that women cannot defend themselves if put into danger and so will have to call policemen to rescue them, as he alleged occurred in the harassment incident described above. By allowing the deployment of policewomen despite tradition, Hayef believes the overall Islamic identity of the state of Kuwait will erode. As a result, the very community to be policed will be alienated. He also pointed out that the country's development plan states that any new laws and programs are not to violate Islamic law. Likewise, a Saudi news website, Waahg, devoted a whole article to the notion that Kuwaiti policewomen require male police protection in doing their jobs and are useful only as female decoys in male police officers' operations to fight harassment against women.

Kuwaiti religious cleric Ojaili Al-Nashimi also entered the media fray in defense of tradition. According to *Jouniha News Portal*, he cited tribal tradition in penning a *fatwa* against the deployment of policewomen. He told *Jouniha*, "A man's salute to a military woman is a breach of tribal and urban tradition." This comment referred to an April 2009 report in *Gulf News*<sup>4</sup> in which a female officer filed an official complaint with the Kuwait national police when a policeman refused to salute her. The policemen allegedly claimed that to do so was below his "dignity" because she was a woman. Reportedly, other policewomen who came to the female officer's defense pointed out that saluting signals respect for rank in organizations and should be separated from

gender identity. Although Al-Nashimi's *fatwa* is not legally binding in Kuwait, there is considerable informal social and political pressure for Kuwaitis to adhere to such religious decrees.

Three other events were also seized upon by opponents of policewomen in Kuwait, according to an article in 2010 in the *Kuwait Times*. Earlier that year a policewoman was witnessed vacationing in Sharm El Sheikh, Egypt, with a male colleague to which she was not married. Another policewoman was allegedly caught drunk driving. And, an unmarried policewoman and a policeman were spotted in a shameful embrace while parked at the seafront. Hayef used these incidents to argue that policewomen were not adequately being kept in female-only zones within police stations and headquarters and as such, were being tasked in ways not commensurate with a Muslim country. A series of citizen interviews by the *Kuwait* Times journalist elicited an array of responses from disdain for the policewomen to "amusement." Some respondents considered the scandals to be isolated incidents while others condemned policewomen as an institution. One Kuwaiti man explained that enlisting policewomen was a terrible idea due to cultural traditions around gender segregation: "[They] will only lead to problems" when deployed alongside men. Worse, he explained, "the shameful actions of policewomen have affected Kuwait's reputation."

Another discourse about policewomen being in breach of tradition revolved around the quasi-military environment. Masculine pursuits such as firearms training and physical combat are taken to be inappropriate for women. Conservative politician Waleed al-Tatabae stated that "the military environment is just not suitable for women," using the example of their training in the use of firearms. Although women are not deployed with firearms, they train in the proper use of them as police professionals do around the world. More importantly, this is common practice across the Gulf countries. However, conservatives, as reported in Al-Islam *Al-Yom*, believe this practice to be in violation of Islamic traditions which envision women as having the domestic responsibilities as mothers and wives, and not to be involved in military or quasi-military activities. A March 26, 2010, Gulf News headline read, "Kuwait Interior Minister under fire for allowing policewomen to use guns and join combat force," responding to pictures the day before in the paper showing black-clad policewomen carrying guns and practicing combat operations.

# A BLIND IMITATION OF... WESTERNIZED COUNTRIES

Conservative Member of Parliament Muhammed Hayef was quoted in the *Kuwait Times* and in *Middle East Online* as proclaiming that having policewomen in Kuwait is a "...a blind imitation of... Westernized countries..." In a counter-framing to the argument

<sup>4</sup> A similar article appears in print in *Al Dar*, but could not be accessed electronically to be included in this research.

that suggest their presence represents the progress in the development or modernization of Kuwait, this theme is a critique of policewomen as a mere Western transplant. Another article from a Syrian-based news website opined that policewomen in Kuwait "... [are] the latest step that the U.S. ally has taken toward greater participation of women in society..." linking Western influence to the phenomenon.

#### POLICEWOMEN AND THE "IMPOSSIBLE DREAM"

Political scientist Mary Ann Tétreault (2001) highlights the perhaps "impossible dream" that Kuwait can be both "developed" and "traditional" at the same time. From this perspective, the society is operating with a potential contradiction which complicates gender roles and relations, and remains to be sorted out. However, the media landscape may obscure more hidden and informal discourses. According to Haya Al-Mughni (2001), Kuwaitis often practice a double-speak on gender issues. Politicians and governmental elites seem to pay lip service to the imported notion of gender equality while subverting it in intimate contexts. Al-Mughni point out that political and social issues of the day are decided in men's gatherings (diwaniya)<sup>5</sup> among the families who control the country (ashira). This reflects entrenched modes of interacting between the elites and the people (Ehteshami 2003). Loyalty to the *hamula*, a patrilineal descent group of families with a common ancestor, remains the primary factor in decision-making. Women are then considered the carriers of honor (sharaf) and morality (iraid) and maintain these values through their roles as wives and mothers (Al-Thakeb 1985). Although other social units, such as the "extended nuclear family," brought to Kuwait through the colonial experience of Westernization and modernization, forms a palpable unit of social organization as well - families maintained strong ties with kinship networks.

In this context, the bipolarity may indeed seem like an "impossible dream" and part of the global contemporary political struggle linking gender inequality to ethnic and religious tradition - the domain of the *diwaniya*. Certainly, conscious of the power of this bipolar discourse, official and semi-official media outlets exploit the apparent show-down in order to communicate that Kuwait is achieving progress in liberalizing the country – despite the critique from conservative quarters. Further, conservative critiques can be caged and de-fanged for a global audience by framing it as an entertaining and a backwards-looking dissent from conservatives and clerics whose full, nuanced arguments will have to be left for more off-the-beaten-path news websites.

For example, arguments focusing on the nation-

alistic aims and modern development symbolized by Kuwaiti police officers appear more often in publications which inhabitants of Kuwait, whether citizens or expatriates, might read. Meanwhile, the related policewomen-as-pioneers theme resonates well with foreign, western and neo-liberal audiences because it references freedom of choice in employment, a dominant value in western-based, liberal feminist discourse. American blogger Desert Girl (2008) posted an enthusiastic comment about the implementation of Kuwaiti policewomen, on March 3, 2008:

...to see WOMEN in HEJAB [sic] in a K-9 unit is a major accomplishment. I truly [sic] applaud you, ladies. To boldly go where many of your brothers refuse. My compliments!

Another American expatriate blogging from Qatar about the women police in Kuwait proclaimed on her blog:

Wooo HOOO [sic] on you, Kuwaiti policewomen! It is always hard to be in the vanguard, you take the criticisms, you take the disbelieving stares, and you handle questions, even from your own families. It's always tough to be out front – to be a leader (Intlxpat 2009).

The pioneering discourse, involving the corollaries of gender equality and freedom of choice, has internal buy-in, but probably less so than reported. In the sample of articles analyzed, the theme was more often identifiable as editorializing by the journalist, rather than apparent from direct comments from Kuwaitis interviewed on the subject.

Therefore, a middle way seems to be operating, in which the seeming contradictions of tradition versus modernization are holding together in one society. The media discourse assumes bipolarity. Yet, the discussion on the respect for tradition both proponents and detractors exhibit is the glue that holds the phenomenon of policewomen together. Kuwait lagged behind other Gulf States, except Saudi Arabia, in bringing women into policing. It is forty years behind Bahrain and Oman in this regard. There was a 14-year delay between the royal promise to bring women in and their actual arrival. Although there is radio silence about the exact reasons for the delay, one policewoman in a March 2012 Arab Times article speculated that internal dissent and concerns about the threat to Kuwait gender-related traditions stalled early efforts. Kuwait's concern with tradition, and the hold that aspects of the conservative critique have on the country, are real. This does not mean that policewomen should necessarily be limited by the demands of salafi politicians, but rather that the proponents and detractors of policewomen are closer cousins than the bipolar media framing conveys to the casual newspaper reader.

<sup>5</sup> Some *diwaniyat* (pl.) in Kuwait are open to women's participation.

Rather than completely breaking the mold as pioneers for full gender equality, policewomen are actually best described as neo-traditional - a new manifestation of how to keep traditional gender segregation, expectations, and roles in check in a rapidly changing, globalized environment. As a recent Institute for Near East and Gulf Military Analysis (INE-GMA) report (Al-Dafaa and Karasik 2011) surmised, women were brought into the Kuwaiti national police "...to handle situations that cannot be handled by men," such as screening women in airports and providing services for women while on patrol in the nation's malls (8). As one Kuwaiti policewomen told Middle East Online, "...in our society women like to deal with other women." Perhaps it is also true that many people like it when women like to deal with other women; there is a cultural comfort in structures which are set up so that women can deal with other women when interacting in public settings. The irony remains that this will give opportunity for some women to take on new roles, even as the overall gender roles are maintained, albeit in a new way. If those new ways are offensive to some, this is not a showdown between traditional and modernization, but rather one between a status quo tradition and neo-tradition. It represents a space where an Islamic feminist notion of women's roles can emerge, where tradition and policing by women can coexist.

Moreover, it is important to note that none of the people quoted in the media discourse on any side of the issue showed any indication of intending to have policewomen give up adherence to their cultural, religious, or gender identities, but that what those identities could accommodate in the present age had altered or expanded. Thus one can consider that the neo-traditional approach paints policewomen as a "thin blue line" between the total erosion of tradition in a modern environment and the preservation of it. The neo-traditional can arguably embrace modernization and development, nationalism and opportunity for women's careers, while also staying rooted in a culturally preservationist agenda and being true to other important identities for Kuwaiti women, such as tribal or Muslim ones. It means the "impossible dream" is possible and in fact occurring; unfortunately, it is not being adequately captured in the media discourse.

#### CONCLUSION

From the perspective of economic globalization, simple narratives work best to sell countries to investors and military and political elites as proper places to set up shop and build alliances. For a country like Kuwait that aims to project a friendly atmosphere to global capital and geopolitical elites, the strategy appears to be to put forth rough dichotomies. Perhaps it would be an uphill battle to educate a particular global public on the intricacies of Kuwaiti political and cultural contestations, such as what it means to be Kuwaiti in a traditional sense, and how the new women police fit into that meaning. Even western expatriates who spend significant time in Gulf countries sometimes fail to get beyond the typical modernization-versus-tradition bipolar frame. One educated British expatriate living in Qatar blogged that Kuwait is "...split in two with traditionalists versus modernizers" and pointed to the debate about policewomen as evidence of the schizophrenic state of affairs (Gulf Blog 2010).

The discourse on Kuwaiti policewomen, then, fits into larger patterns of dichotomous framing of gender and society in the Middle East as a result of some political regimes performance of state feminism. For example, Al-Ali (2000) argues that the feminist movement in Egypt has often suffered from being judged based on the extent to which it is either authentic (traditional) or Western. Because of the perceived secularization Middle Eastern states vis-à-vis their more conservative constituents, efforts at state feminism in the region have often been resisted and have given rise to Islamist social movements. These patterns continue to reinforce a binary of tradition versus modernization. As Kandiyoti (1996) explains, the "reactive local discourse" fuels the flames of this type of issue framing across the social and political landscape of the region.

As adjuncts to state feminism, official and semi-official Kuwaiti and Arab media outlets reify the simplified dichotomy and promote policewomen as important symbolic actors in state feminism. They do so by placing them in the frame of modernizing pioneers under the banner of gender equality in order to promote the country's seeming liberalization abroad. Kuwait can successfully deploy that simplistic and misleading media projection while leaving the nuances for the *diwaniya*, where the most sincere and culturally-contextualized conversations about policewomen are likely happening, among Kuwaitis themselves.

<sup>6</sup> Walter Miller (1973) coined the phrase "reverse projection" to explain this type of political phenomena. He defined the term as occurring when political actors with set positions on an issue define every other opinion on the same issue as opposite to their own, even when they are not exact opposite opinions, but rather nuances along a continuum.

<sup>7</sup> This is a play on the adage that the police in western societies are the "thin blue line" between law and order and total anarchy.

### **APPENDIX A**

# **Articles analyzed**

7,1,					
	Date	Article title	Publication	Language: English, Arabic, or both	Ownership of publication
1	July 24, 2008	Al-Kuwait tifta bab al-tisjeel lil-shirta al- nisa'iya fi september¹	Asharq Al- Awsat	Arabic	Independent Saudi owner, based in London
2	March 29, 2009	Al-Kuwait: takharaj aul dufa' lil-shirta al-nisa'iya²	Asharq Al- Awsat	Arabic	Independent Saudi owner, based in London
3	April 21, 2009	Kuwait: Police open to women, but Islamists oppose	Dalje.com	English	Croatian news website
4	April 22, 2009	Can't salute a woman policeman tells female officer in Kuwait	Gulf News	Both	Semi-official Emirati newspaper
5	July 2009	Mustasharban tiskheer imkanat al-wazarat lil-shirta nisa'iya Hayef: al-khalid lesa yuaidan 'ala al-istajoab <sup>3</sup>	Al-Islam Al-Yom	Arabic	Independent Saudi owner, based in Riyadh
6	November 6, 2009	Ashirta nisa'iya fi kul al-qita'at al- amaniya Kuwaitiya⁴	El-Bashayer	Arabic	Independent Egyptian news website
7	November 5, 2009	Policewomen introduction proved a success official	Kuwait News Agency (KUNA)	Both	Official Kuwaiti press releases
8	March 26, 2010	Kuwait interior minister under fire for allowing policewomen to use guns and join combat forces	Gulf News	Both	Semi-official Emirati newspaper
9	May 5, 2010	Lawmakers propose all-female police stations in Kuwait	Q8NRI.com	English	Independently owned news website by non-resident Indians in Kuwait
10	July 2, 2010	Kuwait launches all- woman moral police to fight "negative phenomena"	Gulf News	English	Semi-official Emirati newspaper
11	July 11, 2010	As-shirta nisa'iya fi kuwait titalab t li-dakhil hamayatihun⁵	Waahg	Arabic	Saudi news website
12	July 14, 2010	Kuwait female cops irk officials	Al-Arabiya	Both	Independently owned Emirati news channel and website

<sup>1</sup> Kuwait opens the door to registration of policewomen in September [researcher's translation].

<sup>2</sup> Kuwait: First batch of policewomen graduate [researcher's translation].

<sup>3 [</sup>Proponents] were thankful for the possibilities [offered by] the Directorate of Women Police, Hayef is not celebrating their response [researcher's translation]

<sup>4</sup> Policewomen in all sectors of Kuwaiti security [researcher's translation]

<sup>5</sup> The policewomen of Kuwait ask for intervention for their protection [researcher's translation]

	Date	Article title	Publication	Language: English, Arabic, or both	Ownership of publication
13	July 15, 2010	Kuwait launches female police to monitor behavior in public places	Al-Shorfa	Both	United States Central Command
14	July 17, 2010	Kuwaiti female police ask for their counterparts' help	Jouhina Portal News	English	Independently owned Syrian news website
15	September 17, 2010	You're under arrest!	Kuwait Times	English	Semi-official Kuwaiti newspaper
16	September 9, 2010	Kuwait's new policewomen are force to be reckoned with	Middle East Online	Both	London-based website
17	February 24, 2012	Kuwaiti women make it in police force	Arab Times	English	Semi-official Kuwaiti newspaper
18	April 22, 2012	Police to monitor women at cafés	Kuwait Times	English	Semi-official Kuwaiti newspaper

### **REFERENCES**

Abu-Lughod, Leila. 2009. "Overview: Engaging the Arab Human Development Report 2005 on Women." *International Journal of Middle Eastern Studies* 41: 59-60.

Al-Ali, Nadje. 2000. Secularism, Gender and the State in the Middle East: The Egyptian Women's Movement. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Al-Dafaa, Naimah, and Theodore Karasik. 2011. Women in Gulf Security Forces. Dubai, United Arab Emirates: Institute for Near East and Gulf Military Analysis.

Al-Jandaly, Bassma. 2003. "Improving image, Crushing Crime." *Gulf News*. Accessed from http://gulfnews.com/news/uae/general/improving-image-crushing-crime-1.362084.

Al-Mughni, Haya. 2001. Women in Kuwait: The Politics of Gender. London: Saqi Books.

Al-Thakeb, Fahed T. 1985. "The Arab Family and Modernity: Evidence from Kuwait." Current Anthropology 26: 575-580.

Al-Watan. 2009. "First Group of Policewomen Graduate." *Here, There and Everywhere*. March 26. Accessed from http://intlxpatr. wordpress.com/2009/03/26/first-kuwaiti-policewomen-graduate.

Arab Times. 2007a. "Kuwait Blazing 'Trail' in Region: Cherie Blair: Political Leaders Earn Praise." *Arab Times*, April 27. Accessed from http://www.arabtimesonline.com.

Arab Times. 2007b. "Women Only Police Force Ruled Out in Saudi Arabia." *Arab Times*, March 7, Accessed from http://www.arabtimes.com.

Asharq Al-Awsat. 2008. "Al-Kuwait tiqtah bab al-tishjeel lil-shirta nisa'iya fi September." *Asharq Al-Awsat*, April 18. Accessed from http://www.awsat.com.

Badawi, Jamal. 1995. Gender Equity in Islam. Plainfield, IN: American Trust Publications.

Barthes, Ronald. 1972/1957. Mythologies. New York: Hill and Wang.

Central Intelligence Agency (CIA). 2012. "The World Factbook: Kuwait." Last Modified March 29, 2012. Accessed from https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/ku.html.

Centre for Research on Globalization. 2006. "Kuwait Signs Security Agreement with NATO." December 13. Accessed from: http://www.globalresearch.ca/index.php?context=va&aid=4138.

Committee on Women in NATO Forces. 2009. Meeting Records 2009. Accessed from http://www.nato.int/issues/women\_nato/meeting-records/2009/meeting-records-2009.html.

Desert Girl. 2008. "Desert Girl on Kuwait." Accessed from http://desertgirlkuwait.blogspot.com/2008/03/you-go-k-9-kuwaiti-police-girlfriend.html.

Doumato, Elanor Abdella, and Marsha Pripsten Posusney. 2003. Women and Globalization in the Arab Middle East: Gender, Economy and Society. Boulder, CA: Lynne Rienner Publishers.

Ehteshami, Anoushiravan. 2003. "Reform from Above: The Politics of Participation in the Oil Monarchies." *International Affairs* 79: 53-75.

Ferrell, Jeff. and Clinton R. Saunders. 1995. Cultural Criminology. Boston, MA: Northeastern University Press.

——. and Keith Hayward and John Young. 2008. Cultural Criminology. London: Sage Publications.

Fürsich, Elfriede. 2009. "In Defense of Textual Analysis: Restoring a Challenged Method for Journalism and Media Studies." *Journalism Studies* 10(2): 238-252.

Goldstein, Herman. 1977. Policing a Free Society. Cambridge, MA: Ballinger.

Gulf Blog. 2010. "Kuwait Introduces Female Police." Accessed from http://thegulfblog.com/tag/kuwaiti-women.

Haberfeld, Maria and Lior Gideon. 2008. "Introduction." In *Comparative Policing: The Struggle for Democracy*, edited by M. Haberfeld, and I. Cerrah, 1-12. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Herzfeld, Michael. 1997. Cultural Intimacy: Social Poetics in the Nation-State. London: Routledge.

Intlxpatr. 2009. "First Kuwaiti Policewomen Graduate." Accessed from *Here There and Everywhere*: http://intlxpatr.wordpress.com/2009/03/26/first-kuwaiti-policewomen-graduate.

Kandiyoti, Deniz. 1996. "Contemporary Feminist Scholarship and Middle East Studies." In *Gender the Middle East: Emerging Perspectives*, edited by D. Kandiyoti, 1-28. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press.

——. 1998. "Some Awkward Questions on Women and Modernity in Turkey." In *Remaking Women: Feminism and Modernity in the Middle East*, edited by Leila Abu-Lughod, 270-287. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Katz, Jack. and Thomas J. Csordas. 2003. "Phenomenological Ethnography in Sociology and Anthropology." *Ethnography* 4(3): 275-288.

Kuwait News Agency (KUNA). 2001. "Kuwaiti Government Approves Creations of Policewomen." May 6.

Kuwait News Agency (KUNA). 2007. "Kuwait's Female Inspectors Work Hand-in-Hand with Colleagues." September 23.

Kuwait News Agency (KUNA). 2012. "Sheikha Suad Pleased at Current Women Status in Gulf but Calls for Greater." April 18. Kuwait Times. 2007. "Sound off: Here are the Views of Some Students on 'Women Police." *Kuwait Times* May 2.

Martibez, Candace and Gayle Allard. 2008-2009. "Foreign Direct Investment and Social Policy: The Links in Developing Countries." *The Journal of Business in Developing Nations* 11: 77-112.

Miller, Walter. 1973. "Ideology and Criminal Justice Policy: Some Current Issues." *Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology* 64(2): 141-154.

Moghadem, Valentine. 2003. Modernizing Women: Gender and Social Change in the Middle East (2nd ed.). Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Books.

Moumneh, Rasha. 2011. "The Gulf's Gender Anxiety." *The Guardian*. July 6. Accessed from http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2011/jul/06/gulf-gender-anxiety-transgender.

Said, Edward. 1993. Culture and Imperialism. London: Vintage Books.

Stetson, Dorothy M., and Amy G. Mazur. 1995. Comparative State Feminism. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Strobl, Staci. 2007. "Women and Policing in Bahrain." Unpublished dissertation, City University of New York, Graduate Center.

——.. 2008. "The Women's Police Directorate in Bahrain: An Ethnographic Observation of a Gender Segregated Unit and the Likelihood of Integration." *International Criminal Justice Review* 18: 39-58.

——... 2010a. "Post-Colonial Policing and the "Woman" Question: A History of the Women's Police Directorate in Bahrain." In *Policing and Prisons in the Middle East: Formations of Coercion*, edited by L. Khalili, and J. Schwedler, 119-135. New York: Columbia University Press.

——. 2010b. "Progressive or Neo-Traditional? Policewomen in Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) Countries." *Feminist Formation* 22(3): 51-74.

Sung, Hung-En. 2006. "Structural determinants of police effectiveness in market economies." Police Quarterly 9(1): 3-19.

Tétreault, Mary Ann. 2001. "A State of Two Minds: State Culture, Women and Politics in Kuwait." *International Journal of Middle Eastern Studies* 33: 203-220.

——. 2003. "Kuwait: Sex, Violence, and the Politics of Economic Restructuring." In *Women and Globalization in the Arab Middle East: Gender, Economy and Society*, edited by E. A. Doumato, and M. P. Posusney, 215-238. Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers.

The Associated Press. 1994. "Kuwait to Let Women Join Police Force." July 13.

The Baluchistan Times. 2011. "Government Committed to Empower Women, Prime Minister." *The Baluchistan Times*. November 25.

The Emirates Center for Strategic Studies and Research. 2009. "Introduction." In *The Arabian Gulf: Between Conservatism and Change*, edited by T. E. Research, 3-14. Abu Dhabi, UAE: The Emirates Center for Strategic Studies and Research.

Toumi, Habib. 2010. "Kuwaiti Women Make it in Police Force." Arab Times, March 26. www.arabtimesonline.com.

United Nations. 2005. Arab Human Rights Development Report. New York: United Nations.

World Economic Forum. 2012. *The Global Competitiveness Report 2011-2012*. Accessed from World Economic Forum: http://www.weforum.org/issues/global-competitiveness.